

DOCUMENT TRACKING SLIP

Document Control Number: OCOD - 07.03, 2023 - 01 - GCG	Date of Communication: 26 JUNE 2023	Date / Way Received: 03 JULY 2023
Event / Subject: VALIDATION RESULT OF TPB'S 2022 PERFORMANCE SCORECARD		Date of Event:
Company: GCG		Venue:
Contact Person/Designation: JUSTICE ALEX L. QUIROZ (ref.) CHAIRPERSON		Contact Details:

Date	From	To	Instructions/Action/Remarks
7-4-2023	OCOD	CORPLAN	COPY TO SIR VINCE -mem



Office of the President of the Philippines
GOVERNANCE COMMISSION
FOR GOVERNMENT OWNED OR CONTROLLED CORPORATIONS
3/F, BDO Towers Paseo, 8741 Paseo De Roxas, Makati City, Philippines 1226



Management
System
ISO 9001:2015

www.tuv.com
ID 9105080199

26 June 2023

ATTY. MA. ESPERANZA CHRISTINA GARCIA-FRASCO

Secretary, Department of Tourism and TPB Chairperson

MS. MARIA MARGARITA M. NOGRALES

Acting Chief Operating Officer (COO)

TOURISM PROMOTIONS BOARD (TPB)

*4/F Legaspi Towers 300, Roxas Boulevard
cor. Vito Cruz, Malate, Manila*

**RE : VALIDATION RESULT OF TPB'S
2022 PERFORMANCE SCORECARD**

Dear Secretary Garcia-Frasco and Acting COO Nograles,

We respectfully furnish you with the TPB's 2022 Performance Scorecard (**Annex A**), where TPB obtained an overall score of **69.90%**.

Very truly yours,

Justice ALEX L. QUIROZ (ret.)
Chairperson

cc: COA Resident Auditor – TPB

TOURISM PROMOTIONS BOARD (TPB)
Validation Result of the 2022 Performance Scorecard

CUSTOMERS / STAKEHOLDERS											
Component						TPB Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating System	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
SO 1		Implement innovative Marketing and Promotions Programs									
SM 1	Percentage of Marketing and Promotional Programs Under the Board-Approved Work and Financial Plan Implemented	Number of Planned Marketing and Promotional Programs Implemented / Total Number of Planned Marketing and Promotional Programs	15%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	100%	53.24% 74 implemented out of 139 planned/ programmed Marketing and Promotional Programs	7.99%	86.67%	13%	Board-approved 2022 Work and Financial Plan Memoranda on the Revision of Project or Transfer of Project Funds Terminal Reports Accomplishment Reports Official Receipts Photo Documentation	The validated accomplishment refers to 78 programs implemented in 2022 out of the 90 programs scheduled for implementation.
SM 2	Return on Marketing Investment (ROMI) of TPB Domestic and International Marketing and Promotions Projects	(Benefit - Cost) / Cost ¹	10%	Below 1179% = 0% 1179% to 1189% = 5% 1190% to 1200% = 8% Above 1200% = 10%	Above 1200%	Benefit: 3,982,322,589.83 Budget Utilized: 162,859,778.13 ROMI: 2,345.25%	10%	Cannot be validated	0%	Excel File of the Detailed Computation of ROMI on TPB Domestic and International Marketing and Promotions Projects Actual Budget Utilized Report as	On the computation of cost, TPB submitted supporting documents (Disbursement Vouchers, Liquidation Vouchers, LDDAP and Official Receipts) for selected transactions only. For selected transactions with supporting documents, GCG noted inconsistencies in the reported amount versus the actual amount

¹ Where: Benefit = Values Generated Out of Sales and Cost = Project Fund Expended by TPB.

for

Validation Result of 2022 Performance Scorecard (*Annex A*)

Component					TPB Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating System	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual		Rating	
										Component of ROMI Computation Terminal/Mileage Reports Copy of Disbursement Vouchers and Liquidation Vouchers Official Receipts and Certification	Lastly, there were transactions that should be excluded in the computation of ROMI as they were not implemented in 2022. The list of transactions with adverse findings are presented in Appendix 1 .
	SM 3	Return on Marketing Investment (ROMI) of TPB Marketing Communications Projects	(Media Values – Media Spend) / Media Spend ²	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	Above 120%	Media Value: 857,226,348.19 Budget Utilized: 288,233,815.79 ROMI: 197.41%	10%	Cannot be validated	0%	Excel File of the Detailed Computation of ROMI on TPB Marketing Communication Projects Actual Budget Utilized Report as Component of ROMI Computation Copies of Media Mileage, Press Releases, and Accomplishment/Terminal Reports Copy of Disbursement Vouchers

² Where: Media Values = Impression, Reach, etc.; Media Spend = Cost Paid for Placements, etc.

Component					TPB Submission			GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating System	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
SO 2	Strengthen Partnership with Stakeholders and Customers										
SM 4	Number of Domestic and International Promotions Events/Projects Organized by Suppliers and Other Stakeholders Assisted by TPB	Actual Accomplishment	15%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	121	122 implemented out of 121 target number of Domestic and International Promotions Events/Projects Organized by Suppliers and Other Stakeholders Assisted by TPB	15%	120	14.88%	Summary Report Letter/Communication from Requesting Party Accomplishment Reports Letters of Receipt/Gratitude from TPB Stakeholder Photo Documentation / Presentations TPB internal documents such as copies of Project Proposal Forms, Budget Breakdown Forms, Certificate of Availability of Funds, Requisition and Issue Slips, Property Gate Passes	GCG observed double counting of one (1) event - "Ride with a Purpose" dated 25 to 26 June 2022 at Mauban, Quezon – hence, the revised validated accomplishment.
SO 3	Improve Customer Satisfaction Rating										
SM 5a	Percentage of Satisfied Customers (Exhibitors)	Number of Respondents Who Gave At Least Satisfactory Rating	2.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	90%	98%	2.5%	98%	2.5%	CSS Final Report Data Collection Quality Control Report	The data gathering was conducted on 19 August 2022 to 09 January 2023.

Validation Result of 2022 Performance Scorecard (*Annex A*)

Component						TPB Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure			Formula	Weight	Rating System	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual		Rating	
	SM 5b	Percentage of Satisfied Customers (Attendees)	/ Total Number of Respondents	2.5%	If Below 80% = 0%	90%	93.8%	2.5%	93.77%	2.5%	Quarterly Monitoring Reports Tabulation of Aggregate Data Samples of Accomplished Survey Forms Database of Back Checking and Spot Checking of Responses	
	SM 5c	Percentage of Satisfied Customers (Familiarization Trip Participants and Social Media Influencers)		2.5%		90%	98%	2.5%	98%	2.5%		
	Sub-total				57.5%			50.49%		35.38%		
FINANCIAL	SO 4	Maintain Efficient, Accountable and Transparent Financial Process and System										
	SM 6a	Obligations Budget Utilization Rate	Total Obligations / Total DBM-Approved COB (Both Net of PS Cost)	5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	90%	86.36% (1,287,677,567.05 / 1,491,085,973.50)	4.32%	86.36%	4.8%	2022 DBM-Approved Corporate Operating Budget Budget Monitoring Report Statement of Appropriation, Allocation, Obligation, Disbursement.	The validated accomplishment is based on the obligations amounting to ₱1.29 Billion and DBM-approved COB equal to ₱1.49 Billion, both net of PS Cost and Special Contingency Fund (SCF). ³

³ Per Sec. 52 of the Implementing Rules and Regulations of R.A. No. 9593 or the Tourism Act of 2009, 10% of the allocation of promotions and marketing shall be set aside as SCF. SCF shall be used in the event of emergencies to provide the PTPB with sufficient resources to undertake marketing and promotions activities that will encourage sustained tourism interest in the Philippines and that will address the adverse effects of these emergencies.

Validation Result of 2022 Performance Scorecard (*Annex A*)

Component						TPB Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating System	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
SM 6b	Disbursements Budget Utilization Rate	Total Disbursements / Total Obligations (Both Net of PS Cost)	2.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	90%	46.05% (592,948,586.88 / 1,287,677,567.05)	1.28%	100%	2.5%	Balances as of 31 December 2022 submitted through the ICRS 2022 COA Annual Audit Report – Statement of Comparison of Budget and Actual Amounts	The validated accomplishment is based on the actual disbursement amounting to ₱1.30 Billion and total obligations equal to ₱1.29 Billion, both net of PS Cost and SCF.
SM 6c		Total Disbursements / DBM-Approved Corporate Operating Budget (Both Net of PS Cost)	2.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	90%	39.77% (592,948,586.88 / 1,491,085,973.50)	1.10%	86.96%	2.42%		The validated accomplishment is based on the actual disbursement amounting to ₱1.30 Billion and DBM-approved COB equal to ₱1.49 Billion, both net of PS Cost and SCF.
SM 7	Decrease in Previous Years' (PY) and <u>Current Year's</u> Unliquidated Fund Transfers to DOT Overseas and Regional Offices	(Balance of PY Unliquidated Fund Transfers in 2022 – Balance of PY Unliquidated Fund Transfers in 2021) / Balance of PY Unliquidated Fund Transfers in 2021	2.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	80% Decrease in PY Unliquidated Fund Transfers	50.48% Balance as of 31 December 2022: 289,531,844.03 Balance as of 31 December 2021: 584,662,203.32	1.26%	84.39% Increase of PY Unliquidated Fund Transfers	0%	2022 COA Annual Audit Report 2021 COA Annual Audit Report	As per 2022 COA AAR the balance of unliquidated fund transfers to DOT of completed programs or projects amounted to ₱491.04 Million which is an increase from the ₱266.31 Million balance in CY 2021.
SO 5 Establish the Business Development Function of TPB											
SM 8	Implement TPB Business Development Plan	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Board-Approved TPB Business Development Plan	Board Approval pursuant to BR No. 370, s. 2022	5%	Board-Approved TPB Business Development Plan	5%	Board Resolution No. 370, s 2022	Target met.
Sub-total			17.5%				12.96%		14.72%		

Component					TPB Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating System	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating				
INTERNAL PROCESS	SO 6 Maintain Efficient, Accountable and Transparent Administrative Process and System											
	SM 9	Percentage of Application Processed within Prescribed Turnaround Time	Total Number of Applications processed within Prescribed Turnaround Time ⁴ / Total Number of Applications Received	7.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	100%	573 / 576 (99.48%) transactions were processed on the prescribed turnaround time	7.46%	97.27%	7.3%	TPB's Citizen's Charter TAT Monitoring Reports Application and Approval Documents of randomly selected transactions	TPB processed 535 transactions within the prescribed TAT out of the 550 total transactions received.
	SM 10	Attain ISO Certification	Actual Accomplishment	7.5%	All or Nothing	Maintain ISO 9001:2015 Certificate	Maintained ISO 9001:2015 Certification	7.5%	ISO 9001:2015 Certificate Maintained	7.5%	ISO 9001:2015 Certification Third-party Surveillance Audit Report	Target met.
	SM 11	Percentage of Implementation of Information Systems Strategic Plan (ISSP)	Number of Deliverables due for 2022 Attained / Total Number of Deliverables due for 2022 ⁵	5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	100% Attainment of 2022 Deliverables Based on the 2022-2024 ISSP	54.56% (6/11) of 2022 ISSP deliverables completed	2.73%	100% Attainment of 2022 Deliverables Based on the Revised ISSP 2022-2024	5%	Revised ISSP 2022-2024 Notices to Proceed Checks Official Receipts Certificates of Acceptance Purchase Requests Disbursement Vouchers	There are eight (8) systems due for 2022, all of which are multi-year projects due to be completed in 2024: <ul style="list-style-type: none">Procurement and Management SystemDocument Management SystemCorporate WebsiteInstitutional WebsitesMembership Website

⁴ The prescribed turnaround time shall be based on TPB's compliance with the Republic Act No. 11032 or the Ease of Doing Business Law for all external services.

⁵ Deliverables refer to systems/applications.

Validation Result of 2022 Performance Scorecard (*Annex A*)

Component						TPB Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating System	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
										Certifications of Funds Availability Certifications of Acknowledgement	<ul style="list-style-type: none">E-Resource PortalTravel Philippines AppDOT Foreign Office Websites	
	Sub-total		20%				17.69%		19.8%			
LEARNING & GROWTH	SO 7	Sustain a Culture of Organizational Engagement that Fosters Effective Performance, Lifelong Learning and Growth										
	SM 12	Improve Competency Level of the Organization	Competency Baseline ⁶ 2022 – Competency Baseline 2021	5%	All or Nothing	Improvement in the Competency Baseline of the Organization	8% Improvement from PY 2021: 90% 2022: 98%	5%	Cannot be Validated	0%	Excel File on the Computation of the Organization's Competency Baseline Enhanced TPB Competency Based Framework Guidebook Accomplished Competency Assessment Forms and Position Description Forms of Randomly Selected Employees Certification of No. of Employees Assessed as of 05 December 2022	It was observed that the required competency levels in the Baseline Profiles of Employees No. 1, 27, and 112 were inconsistent with the data recorded in the submitted Excel sheet of the computation of the competency baseline.

⁶ The competency baseline of the organization shall pertain to the average percentage of required competencies met which can be computed using the following formula:

$$\frac{\sum_{a=1}^B \left[\frac{\sum_{b=1}^A (\text{Actual Competency Level})}{(\text{Required Competency Level})_a} \right]}{B} \quad \text{where: } a = \text{Competency required, } A = \text{Total number of competencies required of position, } b = \text{Personnel profiled, } B = \text{Total number of personnel profiled}$$

Component						TPB Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating System	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
										Internal Memorandum on the Enhanced Competency Framework Walkthrough	
	Sub-total		5%				5%		0%		
	TOTAL		100%				86.14%		69.90%		

for

SM 2: RETURN ON MARKETING INVESTMENT (ROMI) OF TPB DOMESTIC AND INTERNATIONAL MARKETING AND PROMOTIONS PROJECTS

DV No.	PROGRAM/PROJECT/ACTIVITY	COST/ACTUAL BUDGET UTILIZED (IN PHILIPPINE PESO)			FINDINGS
		PER EXCEL FILE OF COMPUTATION OF ROMI	PER LIQUIDATION REPORT/VOUCHER	PER DISBURSEMENT VOUCHER	
2022-03-0329	Asia Pacific Incentive and Meetings Event (AIME) 2022	77,180.18	USD 1,471.50	77,180.18	Liquidation report was in USD. TPB did not provide the exchange rate. Hence, GCG cannot objectively establish the actual amount utilized.
2022-03-0328	Asia Pacific Incentive and Meetings Event (AIME) 2022	77,327.33	USD 1,471.50	77,327.33	
2022-03-0285	Asia Pacific Incentive and Meetings Event (AIME) 2022	440,979.00	111,911.44	440,979.00	Validated accomplishment shall refer to the amount reflected in the Liquidation Report/Voucher. Observed variance: ₱329,067.56
2022-03-0281	Asia Pacific Incentive and Meetings Event (AIME) 2022	60,000.00	4,050.75	60,000.00	Validated accomplishment shall refer to the amount reflected in the Liquidation Report/Voucher. Observed variance: ₱55,949.25
2022-09-1354	Incentive Travel and Conventions Meetings Asia (IT&CMA) 2022, Bangkok	7,312,834.60	-	7,301,280.00	Cannot be validated. No liquidation report/voucher submitted. GCG also noted a variance of ₱11,554.60 between the Summary Report and DV.
2022-09-1355	Incentive Travel and Conventions Meetings Asia (IT&CMA) 2022, Bangkok	5,065,614.00	-	6,823,712.00	Cannot be validated. No liquidation report/voucher submitted. GCG also noted a variance of ₱ (1,758,098.00) between the Summary Report and DV.
2022-05-0697	Arabian Travel Market 2022	134,407.00	-	-	For exclusion. No funds disbursed as represented during the onsite validation.
2022-06-813	Arabian Travel Market 2022	134,407.00	-	-	
2022-05-0639	China (Beijing) International Fair for Trade and Services	5,499,999.95	-	-	Three activities were included as part of the cost computation namely, Beijing Intl. Tourism Expo (BITE) - ₱1,500,000.00, Xian Silk Road Intl. Tourism Expo (XSRITE) - ₱1,999,999.98 and China Intl. Fair for Trade in Services (CIFTIS) - ₱1,999,999.98. Per TPB, these activities are to be implemented in 2023, however, only BITE and XSRITE were supported by a memorandum on the new date of

DV No.	PROGRAM/PROJECT/ACTIVITY	COST/ACTUAL BUDGET UTILIZED (IN PHILIPPINE PESO)			FINDINGS
		PER EXCEL FILE OF COMPUTATION OF ROMI	PER LIQUIDATION REPORT/VOUCHER	PER DISBURSEMENT VOUCHER	
					implementation. Hence, the ₱3.5 Million total from BITE and XSRITE shall be excluded. TPB did not submit liquidation report/voucher for CIFTIS.
-	Philippines-China Dive Online Show	2,399,999.91	-	-	For exclusion. Per TPB, the project was implemented in 2021.
2022-10-1696	World Travel Market (WTM) London	3,210,104.46	USD 56,869.15	3,210,104.46	Liquidation report was in USD. TPB did not provide the exchange rate. Hence, GCG cannot objectively establish the actual amount utilized.
-	Asia Pacific Incentive and Meetings Event (AIME) 2022	3,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
-	Asia Pacific Incentive and Meetings Event (AIME) 2022	174,452.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
-	Asia Pacific Incentive and Meetings Event (AIME) 2022	10,000.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-07-0934	M&C Asia Connections	312,000.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-06-0782	IBTM Americas 2022 (PHYSICAL)	3,455,008.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-10-1626	21st Philippine Travel Exchange (PHITEX 2022)	5,350.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-11-1820	21st Philippine Travel Exchange (PHITEX 2022)	4,356.36	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-12-2035	21st Philippine Travel Exchange (PHITEX 2022)	25,562.83	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2023-01-0233	21st Philippine Travel Exchange (PHITEX 2022)	15,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
-	21st Philippine Travel Exchange (PHITEX 2022)	11,559.20	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
-	21st Philippine Travel Exchange (PHITEX 2022)	690,200.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-02-350	UK Travel Trade Familiarization Trip (Batch 2)	990,350.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-05-0631	Arabian Travel Market 2022	3,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-05-0630	Arabian Travel Market 2022	3,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-05-0650	Arabian Travel Market 2022	10,550.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-05-0651	Arabian Travel Market 2022	10,550.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-05-0721	Arabian Travel Market 2022	187,646.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
-	World Travel Market (WTM) London	11,680.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-06-0887	TPB/DOT Tokyo & PAL Invitational Tour for Agents	895,000.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.

DV No.	PROGRAM/PROJECT/ACTIVITY	COST/ACTUAL BUDGET UTILIZED (IN PHILIPPINE PESO)			FINDINGS
		PER EXCEL FILE OF COMPUTATION OF ROMI	PER LIQUIDATION REPORT/VOUCHER	PER DISBURSEMENT VOUCHER	
2022-11-1902	Familiarization Tour with the Japanese Travel Agents for Health and Wellness	979,600.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-11-1827	Philippine Business Mission (PBM) to Japan 2022	11,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-11-1822	Philippine Business Mission (PBM) to Japan 2022	11,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-11-1826	Philippine Business Mission (PBM) to Japan 2022	11,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-11-1825	Philippine Business Mission (PBM) to Japan 2022	11,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
-	10th Regional Travel Fair	466,760.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-05-0602	10th Regional Travel Fair	331,000.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-02-0665	Asia Dive Expo (ADEX) 2022	5,572,246.03	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-04-0576	Internationale Tourismus Borse (ITB) Asia 2022	8,945,619.30	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-06-0884	Internationale Tourismus Borse (ITB) Asia 2022	2,391,750.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
-	Holiday and Travel Show	66,679.20	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-05-0718	Malaysia International Dive Expo 2022	3,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-05-0707	Malaysia International Dive Expo 2022	10,510.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-06-0374	Malaysia International Dive Expo 2022	52,000.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-12-1950	Joint Campaign with Watsons Malaysia Familiarization Trip	218,926.13	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2023-01-0116	Hong Kong SAR Travel Agents Familiarization Trip	881,500.00	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-11-1899	Cebu-Bohol Media/KOLs and Travel Trade Media Familiarization Tour	690,759.70	-	-	No supporting document submitted.
2022-03-0268	Diving Equipment and Marketing Association (DEMA) Show	1,687,373.33	-	-	No supporting document submitted.